

A special meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission convened at 8:15 A.M.

PRESENT: COMMISSIONERS: Julie Bartolotto
Mike Burrous
Kay Cofield
Kevin Doherty
Karen Highberger
Ana Maria McGuan
Kerrie Weaver
William Wynne
Layne Johnson, Chair

EX OFFICIO: Stanley E. Poe

ABSENT: " : Laura Brasser
Doris Felix
Geoff McIntosh (Excused)
Dan Pressburg
Laurence Watt
Kevin Motschall, Vice Chair (Excused)

ALSO PRESENT: Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic
Preservation Officer
Greg Carpenter, Planning Bureau Manager
Michael J. Mais, Assistant City Attorney
Nancy Muth, Deputy City Clerk

Chair Johnson presiding.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Cofield, that the minutes of the meeting held October 20, 2004, be approved as submitted. Carried by unanimous vote.

Commissioner Cofield moved, seconded by Commissioner Wynne, that the minutes of the meeting held October 26, 2004, be approved as submitted. Carried by unanimous vote.

Commissioner Felix entered.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

There was no public participation.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, 2767 East Ocean Boulevard

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Wynne distributed and discussed the "Ad-Hoc Committee Report," a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Brasser entered.

Chair Johnson provided additional information on behalf of the Ad-Hoc Committee.

Roger Kurath, Design 21, 4240 Via Marina, No. 14, Marina Del Rey, architect, distributed a "Time-line" dated November 9, 2004, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Greg Carpenter, Planning Bureau Manager, suggested that the item be tabled until the Bluff Park homeowner's attorney could arrive.

Commissioner Bartolotto moved, seconded by Commissioner Doherty, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction at 2767 East Ocean Boulevard be laid on the table until the Bluff Park homeowners' attorney was present. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto, Cofield, Doherty, Highberger, Weaver, Johnson.
NOES:	"	: Brasser, Burrous, Felix, McGuan, Wynne.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh, Pressburg, Watt, Motschall.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Additions/Alterations, 3760 Orange Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

George McGuire, 3760 Orange Avenue, discussed the proposed project and responded to questions.

Greg Carpenter, Planning Bureau Manager, noted that the Planning Commission was waiting for Cultural Heritage Commission approval before taking action.

Commissioner Watt entered.

November 17, 2004

Commissioner Doherty moved, seconded by Commissioner Weaver, to approve the structure at 3760 Orange Avenue as a contributing structure. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto, Burrous, Cofield, Doherty, Felix, Highberger, Watt, Weaver, Johnson.
NOES:	"	: Brasser, McGuan, Wynne.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh, Pressburg, Motschall.

A discussion ensued regarding what features make the structure contributing.

Commissioner Pressburg entered.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Wynne, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the additions and alterations at 3760 Orange Avenue be laid over to the next meeting. Carried by unanimous vote.

Commissioner Bartolotto moved, seconded by Commissioner Doherty, that Item No. 5.C. be considered at this time. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto, Brasser, Cofield, Doherty, Felix, Highberger, McGuan, Pressburg, Weaver, Johnson.
NOES:	"	: Burrous, Watt, Wynne.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh, Motschall.

Informational Presentation for New Construction, 2401 East Ocean Boulevard

Commissioner Highberger declared a conflict of interest and retired.

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Bill Meyer, Ocean Pines, LLC, 7241 Garden Grove Boulevard, Suite M, Garden Grove, and the project architect spoke regarding the project and responded to questions.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Burrous, that the discussion time be extended five minutes. Carried by unanimous vote.

Isaac Waxsel, 2695 East First Street, addressed the Commission.

Wendy Harn, 3214 East Second Street, President of the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, offered to facilitate meetings with the developer and the Association.

November 17, 2004

A discussion ensued and the applicant was advised to meet with the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association for their input and then return to the Commission.

Commissioner Highberger entered.

It was unanimously agreed to take from the table Item No. 4.A., Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction, 2767 East Ocean Boulevard.

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, 2767 East Ocean Boulevard

Roger Kurath, Design 21, 4240 Via Marina, No. 14, Marina Del Rey, architect, discussed the November 9, 2004 Time-line and the project design revisions; and noted the applicant's efforts to work with the neighborhood.

Mel Nutter, 200 Oceangate, Suite 850, attorney, representing Mr. and Mrs. Makineni, owners, introduced himself and offered to standby to answer questions.

Isaac Waxsel, 2695 East First Street, spoke in opposition to the proposed project.

Meg Beatrice, 17 Temple Avenue, distributed an unsigned "Petition to Reject Proposed New Home and Town Homes Development at 2767 East Ocean Boulevard," a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record; and spoke in opposition to the project.

Wendy Harn, 3214 East Second Street, President of the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, distributed and read the November 16, 2004 letter from the Board of Directors, Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

In response to Commissioner comments, Michael J. Mais, Assistant City Attorney, advised that it was incumbent upon the Commissioners to make decisions regarding conflict of interest and the Fair Political Practices Act and recuse themselves from ruling on an item, when necessary.

Doug Otto, 111 West Ocean Boulevard, Suite 1300, submitted the signed "Petition to Reject Proposed New Home and Town Homes Development at 2767 East Ocean Boulevard," a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record; addressed the ordinance establishing the Bluff Park Historic Landmark District; and spoke in opposition to the proposed project based on the mass and scale.

Steven Westbrook, 2801 East Ocean Boulevard, commented regarding the Galaxy Towers property and the size of the structure on his own double-lot property.

Mel Nutter, 200 Oceangate, Suite 850, attorney, spoke regarding constraints that apply to the modern architectural style, the District-establishing ordinance, and the unique character of a corner property.

November 17, 2004

Roger Kurath, Design 21, 4240 Via Marina, No. 14, Marina Del Rey, architect, provided closing comments regarding the project.

In response to a Commissioner's inquiry, Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, commented regarding a recent California Preservation Foundation and the State Historic Preservation Office workshop dealing with new construction in historic districts; indicated that when historic elements from the neighborhood were incorporated into projects with a somewhat modern twist, large projects were often approved; and confirmed her original recommendation to approve the project based on Secretary of Interior Standards No. 9.

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Brasser, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction at 2767 East Ocean Boulevard be approved in accordance with Ordinance C-6835; Standards and Guidelines, Section B., the project was consistent with subsections 1 and 4, not inconsistent with subsection 2, and subsections 3, 5 and 6 would be observed for both lots and structures; and that the Secretary of Interior Standards Nos. 2, 9 and 3 supported approval. The motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Brasser, Burrous, Felix, McGuan, Wynne.
NOES:	"	: Bartolotto, Cofield, Doherty, Highberger, Pressburg, Watt, Weaver, Johnson.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh, Motschall.

Michael J. Mais, Assistant City Attorney, clarified that failing to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was in effect a defacto denial of the project and that the avenue left for the applicants was an appeal to the Planning Commission.

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, 438 North Crystal Court

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report and distributed a letter from the Willmore City Heritage Association, copies of which were received and made a part of the permanent record.

Gantcho Batchkarov, architect, spoke regarding the proposed project.

A discussion ensued regarding referencing or incorporating architectural features from nearby structures to increase the new construction's compatibility with the neighborhood; and recommended that the applicant consult a book entitled *A Pattern Language* by Christopher Alexander.

Commissioner Burrous moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction at 438 North Crystal Court be laid over to the December 15, 2004 meeting and the applicant revise the design to reflect community input.

November 17, 2004

Michael Reyman, 832 Daisy Avenue, Vice President of the Willmore Heritage Association, spoke regarding the residents' preliminary consensus of the project.

The motion carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Additions/Alterations, 5365 East Second Street

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Burrous moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of solar panels at 5365 East Second Street be approved with the provision that the applicant return to staff with a line of site drawing from the south side of Second Street and the east side of Claremont Avenue showing visibility of the solar panels. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Additions/Alterations, 1351 East Ninth Street

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record, indicating that the applicant was not prepared to return to the Commission.

Commissioner Burrous moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for additions and alterations at 1351 East Ninth Street be laid over to the next appropriate meeting. Carried by unanimous vote.

NEW BUSINESS

Consideration of Approval for Local Landmark Nomination

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Weaver, that the Delker House at 153 East 12th Street be nominated for historic landmark designation under the Commission's criteria A, D, H and I and the Secretary of the Interior Standards, excluding the metal railings. Carried by unanimous vote.

Presentation of the Willmore District Implementation Plan

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

November 17, 2004

David White, Administrative Analyst, Redevelopment Bureau, distributed and discussed the Draft Willmore District Implementation Plan and a flyer for a "Special Willmore City Community Meeting," copies of which were received and made a part of the permanent record; and responded to questions.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Signage on the Lafayette, 144 Linden Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Brasser moved, seconded by Commissioner Wynne, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for signage on the Lafayette at 144 Linden Avenue be approved as submitted with the stipulation that the applicant provide homeowner association formal approval and that staff verify that there was no conflict with other signage on building. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Alterations, 809-815 Orange Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Imelda Martinez, 809-815 Orange Avenue, owner's daughter, spoke regarding the situation with the windows and responded to questions.

A discussion ensued.

Commissioner Doherty moved, seconded by Commissioner Felix, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 809-815 Orange Avenue to retain the 13 vinyl windows previously replaced and to install vinyl windows on the remainder of the structure be denied, based on Secretary of Interior Standards 2, 5 and 6; and that the applicant was required to replace the vinyl windows by installing double hung wood windows to match existing. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto, Cofield, Doherty, Felix, Highberger, Pressburg, Weaver, Johnson.
NOES:	"	: Brasser, Burrous, McGuan, Watt, Wynne.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh, Motschall.

Certificate of Appropriateness for an Addition, 3420 Gundry Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

November 17, 2004

Melissa Bowman, 3420 Gundry Avenue, was introduced and responded to questions.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Burrous, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at 3420 Gundry Avenue be approved as submitted. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Brasser,Burrous, Cofield,Highberger,McGuan, Pressburg,Watt,Weaver, Wynne,Johnson.
NOES:	"	: Doherty,Felix.
ABSENT:	"	: McIntosh,Motschall.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Alterations, 3625 Lemon Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Gary Logan, 3625 Lemon Avenue, spoke regarding the proposed dog-eared style redwood fence and responded to questions.

Commissioner Burrous moved, seconded by Commissioner McGuan, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 3625 Lemon Avenue be approved as submitted with the stipulation that the metal poles be replaced with pressure-treated wood posts.

Grace Fontana, 3621 Lemon Avenue, distributed and discussed an information packet containing photographs and historic preservation materials, copies of which were received and made a part of the permanent record; and spoke in opposition to a previous and the proposed Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commander Richard Fontana, 3621 Lemon Avenue, requested that the Commission consider rescinding the Certificate of Appropriateness for the current chain link fence and denying the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed dog-eared fence.

Michael Grant, Certified Real Estate Appraiser, spoke regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness on behalf of Mr. and Mrs. Fontana and distributed a packet of information, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Gary Logan, 3625 Lemon Avenue, had an opportunity to respond.

Commissioner Wynne retired.

The motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Brasser,Burrous,Cofield,McGuan.
-------	----------------	---------------------------------

NOES: " : Bartolotto,Doherty,Felix,
Highberger,Pressburg,Watt,
Weaver,Johnson.
ABSENT: " : McIntosh,Motschall,Wynne.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Watt, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 3625 Lemon Avenue be approved as submitted with the stipulations that the metal poles be replaced with pressure-treated wood posts, the six-foot dog-eared fence end at the corner of the applicants house, and design detail returned to staff for review. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Alterations, 3761 Gundry Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Burrous and Cofield retired.

Tarak Mohamed, 3761 Gundry Avenue, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed project.

Commissioner McGuan retired.

Commissioner Doherty moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations at 3761 Gundry Avenue be denied. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, 1136 Daisy Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Maria Rosales, 1136 Daisy Avenue, was introduced and responded to questions.

Commissioner Watt moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction at 1136 Daisy Avenue be approved with the stipulation that the vinyl windows be exchanged for double hung wood windows and style detail to return to staff for review. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Alterations, 3740 Brayton Avenue

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

November 17, 2004

Charles Stevens, 3740 Brayton Avenue, was introduced and responded to questions.

A discussion ensued regarding the fireplace replacement, the removal of the round windows, and the replacement of the roof tile.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Weaver, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for 3740 Brayton Avenue be held over to allow applicant to resubmit a revised plan. Carried by unanimous vote.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Additions/Alterations, 328 Eliot Lane

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Joseph Cohen, father of applicant, discussed the proposed project and responded to questions.

Commissioner Brasser moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for additions and alterations at 328 Eliot Lane be approved as submitted with the following stipulations, that the S-tile on the front entry eyebrow be replaced with barrel tile to match existing, the new windows be double hung wood windows, and the brick façade removed. Carried by unanimous vote.

Staff Report

Cindy Thomack, Neighborhood and Historic Preservation Officer, discussed a holiday luncheon for the Commission to be held on December 15, 2004 at Commissioner Brasser's home; indicated that the appointment to the Long Beach Navy Memorial Heritage Association would be on the December agenda; and noted that the City no longer provided business cards.

ADJOURNMENT

At 1:20 P.M., Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Brasser, that the meeting be adjourned. Carried by unanimous vote.